



BROOKLYN COMMUNITY BOARD 13
1201 Surf Avenue – 3rd Fl., Brooklyn, NY 11224
(718) 266-3001 FAX (718) 266-3920
<http://www.nyc.gov/html/bkncb13>

ANTONIO REYNOSO
Borough President

LUCY MUJICA DIAZ
Chairperson

EDDIE MARK
District Manager

**COMMUNITY BOARD 13
BOARD MEETING
MINUTES**

Date: Wed., April 26, 2023

Time: 7:00 P.M.

Loc.: Zoom

PRESENT:

Lucy Mujica Diaz
Mario Caggiano
Joe Corace
Lolita Divilova
Amarilys Herrera
Angela Kravtchenko
Allen Newman
Robbin Wright Paraison
Sabina Pirmukhamedova
Tatyana Segal
Evelyn Strasser
Edita Volovodovskaya
Annette Wesley

Zunera Ahmed
Sonji Cephas
Asad Dandia
Susan Flaschenberg
Queenie Huling
Yelena Makhnin
Pat O'Brien
Nodira Pirmukhamedova
Michael Russo
Michael Silverman
Barbara Teitelbaum
Gloria Watkins
Svetlana Zelinskaya

Lakeisha Bowers
Marion Cleaver
Julia Daniely
Linda Harrison
Yuriy Krasner
Mark Mernyk
Milagros Quiles
Sam Rinkovsky
Fran Schwartz
Pat Singer
Dennis Vourderis
Joann Weiss

ABSENT:

Dionne Brown
Selina Grant (exc)
Pervez Siddiqui
Gregory Vayngurt

Pat Brown
Erum Hanif
Sheila Smalls

Olga Fort
Emil Purisic
Jack Suben(exc)

GUESTS: Christopher Greif, Ida Sanoff, Olga Fiore(SS Spanton), Laura Glasser, Patricia Lynch, Nadine Dabney, Ronald Greenberg, Robert Busweiler, BC Michael Mandala(FDNY), Susan Savit, Orlando Mendez, Matthew Colton, Sandra Hung Fong, Daniela Rom, Andrew Contrino, Ray Carrera(CAU), Rabbi Weiner(JCCGCI), Bryan Makenzie, Sergei Chuprik(Comptroller Off), Al Kukai Bridgette Purvis(CM Brook Krasny), Craig Hammerman, Anastasia Yaskova(CAU)

STAFF PRESENT

Eddie Mark, D.M., Hanna Glikman, Community Associate, Lucia Knizhnik, Community Assistant, Barbara Santonas, Community Coordinator

Chairperson Lucy Mujica Diaz opened the meeting. She introduced the Staff Members present and remained all in attendance that anything in the Chat will be circulated by the co-host as needed. Anything in the Chat can be Foiled, if requested.

PRESENTATION:

Adam Sammons from Coney Island Health Center explained a little about the facility. It is a Family Qualified Health Center. They turn no patient away. They have primary and specialty care services which includes a wide range of services. One of the services is PREP-Pre-Exposure Prophylaxis HIV Diagnosis. This is for woman to assist in controlling STDs. This requires one pill a day or an injection every two months. Many women in the Coney Island Community are at a high risk of STDs. (This presentation had stopped due to the meeting being hijacked. Mr. Sammons will return at a later date to complete the presentation.

ELECTED OFFICIALS/REPRESENTATIVES

Councilmember Ari Kagan – He attended the Public Forum about the Casino. He agrees with the opposition he heard at the meeting and throughout Southern Brooklyn. The process has just begun. He knows that C.B. 13 is going to vote on a Resolution. He has already received a copy of a Resolution from C.B. 15 already. The opposition is based on thoughts of additional congestion, increase in crime, and increase in mental health problems. Saturday, he hosted a festival at Kaiser Park. It was a very good event. He thanked the Parks Department and local CBO's for their assistance. This morning he attended and interagency event hosted by The Alliance, where many issues were discussed. He requested more police on the boardwalk and along Mermaid Avenue. He will push for more than the usual 80 Summer Detail patrolmen. Lucy said that besides C.B. 15, she has been talking to C.B. 11 who hasn't voted yet. They attended the BP's Forum.

He discussed an email he received about C.B. 13 voting on Guidelines for Street Co-Naming. He said that the City Council does not have a criteria as to how long a person has to have passed away before a street can be named for them. He thinks that one year is a considerable amount of time. Also, he believes that a person should have significant input in the life of New York City, like Jimmy Prince who will have a street co-named for him on July 8th.

Christopher Greif thanked the Councilmember for getting drag racing stopped between W. 12 and West 15th Streets.

Bridgette Purvis – representing Assemblymember Alec Brook Krasny – She said that the AM has had a productive first 100 days in Albany. He has put in many pieces of legislation. Anyone who wants a list should call the office. The office is opened Monday and Wednesday from 10-4 and Friday from 10-2.

Olga Fiore – representing State Senator Jessica Scarcella Spanton – The Senator has just completed her first 100 days in office. They have been very busy and she has accomplished a lot. She has gone to many events, and has gotten several of her bills passed. She is on the Veteran's Affairs Committee, and the Public Safety Committee. She is still looking for a permanent office, has mobile offices Monday through Friday at several locations. To find out where the mobile offices are you can call 718-727-9406.

Zunera Ahmed – representing State Senator Iwen Chu – The Senator is still in Albany working on the Budget. She is working hard to get funding for education and transportation.

Sergei Chuprik – representing Comptroller Brad Lander – The Comptroller sends Greetings. He is very much concerned about Climate change. You can check is Climate Dashboard on his website. You will see updates that shows transition to a green economy.

Ray Carrera – CAU – He is part of the NST – Neighborhood Support Team which will be working on quality of life issues. He hopes that CB 13 will join with BBID to better the quality of life for all concerned. Yelena thanked Anastasia and Ray for working together with the BID to make Brighton brighter.

PUBLIC SESSION:

Christopher Greif stated that the Bus Redesign Public Comment Session is still open. There will be a meeting in Sheepshead Bay and Assemblymember Helene Weinstein's office on Tuesday, May 2nd from 10-12 noon. Comments can also be sent on the MTA Website and directly to him and he will disseminate to the appropriate offices.

Craig Hammerman – Statement made at Board Meeting

First of all, I want to commend you on the development of Street Co-Naming guidelines that will be voted on tonight to create a process that's predictable, transparent and fair – the characteristics of a real democratic process. Predictable to prepare future applicants for what the community board's expectations are—giving them concrete steps to follow. Transparent so there's a standard application that you can rely on to do your due diligence. And, fair, to treat all applicants equally and avoid being arbitrary. So, kudos to you all for coming up with a democratic process.

I only wish the same democratic principles were applied to another matter on your agenda this evening, namely, the resolution on the proposed casino.

The resolution you will be considering tonight was not a product of a democratic process. It did not follow a predictable review process, like a ULURP application would, for example. The process was not transparent. There was no application for the public to review. Any recommendations by the community board will rely mostly on opinion, speculation and media reports, not facts, reports and studies supplied by the developer. We have not had an opportunity to conduct our due diligence yet.

And, the process was not fair. There was no public hearing. You could not have held a public hearing because you had no application to consider. You had a community forum to receive feedback from the community on the concept of a casino proposal. But the casino concept means different things to different people. An application is necessary so we have a common basis for understanding what this community board's "community forum" were no substitutes for a public hearing as the public could not comment on the actual proposal without an application to review.

Let me be clear, I'm not arguing for or against the casino. My comments have nothing to do with the substance of any proposal. I have concerns like many of you about the impact of such a facility, so I am very interested in seeing what will be proposed and commenting on the facts of the proposal. You've heard me say many times before that we don't get anywhere near what we deserve in this district. This community has a long, and growing list of unmet needs. With or without a casino, those needs are not going to take care of themselves. It's the community board's job to make sure that everyone is clear on what the district's needs are. That is a unique and essential City Charter mandate for the community boards.

C.B. 13 is an advisory body, not a decision-making body. This matter will be the subject of public hearings by the NYS Gaming Commission. It will be subject to a ULURP review as guaranteed by the State's process. There's no need for the community board to rush through a resolution before there's even an application for us to respond to. Please don't jump the gun. Please consider deferring action on this important matter until you have an actual application in hand to base your recommendation on. A recommendation based on fact will be rational and considerably stronger than one based on opinion, speculation, and media reports. Anything done now at tonight's meeting would be premature, weaker, irrational, and undemocratic.

Jeff Sanoff – He stated that as Chair of the Environment and Sanitation Committee he added many meetings where Resolutions were passed on issues without having final plan from either EDC, DEC or ACE. There is nothing wrong with the Community Board voting on a Resolution for the casino. All you would have to do is to read their literature and see what the developer wants.

Ida Sanoff – She spoke about what the residents of Coney Island live with every day; narrow peninsula which cannot be changed due to the geography of the peninsula. There is horrific traffic problem, so that in the summer West 8th Street is closed on most weekends so that emergency vehicles can leave the firehouse or the Police Station. It is impossible to fix everything. Here is her statement -The insurmountable problem with the casino is its proposed location at the chokepoint of a narrow peninsula. As it is, Coney Island Traffic not only impacts the West End, but can be so bad at time that it backs up into Brighton Beach. This CANNOT be solved with a Community Benefit Agreement or anything else. The casino people want you to believe that THEY can resolve this problem by throwing money around. THIS IS NOT TRUE!

Ocean side ferry – Contrary to what you have been told, getting a ferry onto the ocean side of Coney at ANY location is NOT a matter of a casino developer (or anyone else) coming up with a few hundred million dollars!

- The problem is the length of the breakwater that will be required – over 1,000 feet long. This is roughly the length of two "bays".
- Such a structure would impact sand transport patterns along the entire peninsula and possibly speed up erosion along the peninsula. It may also exacerbate the problem we already have with the sand buildup along Bayview Avenue.
- It is highly doubtful that such a structure would ever receive the necessary state and federal permits needed for construction. Even EDC admitted this in their ferry presentation.

A bridge over Coney Island Creek – Contrary to what we have been told, money is NOT the issue with getting a bridge built over Coney Island Creek to the Belt Parkway. The north shore of the Creek-Calvert Vaux Park – is an unstable land mass. It was built on top of an old industrial dump and salvage yard (Sarnelli Salvage) and is composed of all sorts of debris and other materials dumped in an unorganized manner. Among other things, it contains the remains of Ft. Lafayette and has been the site of decades of illegal dumping. There are other issues with this property too.

- There are additional problems with the Creek that will likely take decades to resolve. Coney Island Creek is currently being evaluated for Superfund, a very lengthy process. Even the U.S. ACE will not undertake desperately needed flood control measures until Superfund investigations are completed. There are other problems associated with disturbing the highly contaminated material at the bottom of the Creek.
- There are only three north/south routes on the Coney peninsula: Surf, Mermaid and Neptune Avenues. *Adding another entrance/exit point at the western end of Coney will NOT decrease the traffic traveling on these already gridlocked local streets. Keep in mind that in addition to cars, many tour buses will go to the casino and many, many trucks will deliver supplies to the casino, hotel, 20 restaurants and other components.*
- AND...Do the people who use Kaiser Park want to see a highway ramp built alongside it or even through it?

Resilience – Contrary to what you have been told, the casino CANNOT make Coney Island more “hardened to severe weather events...in the face of climate change”.

- They CAN include measures to make the casino BUILDING itself “resilient”, similar to what has been done with the new high-rise buildings that were recently constructed. But this has NOTHING to do with the “resilience” of other buildings on the peninsula.
- The U.S.A.C.E., NOT the casino, is working on flood control measures, not just for Coney, but for the entire NY/NJ metro area.
- Improvements to the electrical grid are NOT being done because of the casino. Con Edison and other power entities are ALREADY IN THE PROCESS of improving the power grid CITYWIDE to meet the new standards to eliminate fossil fuels and provide additional power for electric stoves, car charging stations, etc.

Ida stated that there are three East/West routes out of the area Mermaid, Surf and Neptune Aves. Unfortunately, several Sea Gate residents have died on holiday weekends because ambulances had trouble getting through the traffic.

MINUTES:

Motion to approve minutes of the General Board meeting of March 22, 2023 was made by Joann Weiss and seconded by Marion Cleaver.

VOTE: In Favor: 35 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 1 No Vote (no camera): 4

Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office.

CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT:

Chairperson Lucy Mujica Diaz stated her disappointment that the Board was notified on the appointments of new members **after** the new members were notified. She apologized to the new members if they received the notice of tonight's meeting. She had emailed the Borough President's office to see if they could be excused from voting until they were sworn in, but was told that their appointment was immediate. We will have our June meeting in person, so that we can thank the members who were not reappointed or who chose not to request reappointment, for their service. We hope that everyone will join us.

She introduced all the new board members in attendance, Mark Mernyk, Angela Kravchenko, Julia Daniely, Yuriy Krasner, Linda Harrison, Sonji Cephas. (Sheila Smalls, and Emil Purisic were absent and Sabina Pirmukhamedova signed in later in the meeting).

DISTRICT MANAGER'S REPORT:

District Manager, Eddie Mark welcomed all the new Board members. He reported there were many events this past month. He attended the Blessing of the Rides at Deno's Wonder Wheel Park and official First Ride of the Cyclone at Luna Park. He attended Earth Day event at Kaiser Park which included a Corporate Clean Up with the assistance of employees of National Grid. The bus stop currently at West 33rd St. & Surf Avenue will be relocated to West 36th St. & Surf Avenue due to construction. He will make sure that the correct notice is placed on the bus shelter. This weekend and next week there will be no F service. Also, the street will be closed between Shell Road and Avenue Y to Shore Parkway. Out of the next 21 weekends, 14 weekends during the summer the F train will not stop at Stillwell Avenue. Two weekends are to replace rails at Neptune Avenue Station. We need to write a letter to the MTA stating this is not acceptable. On May 20th The Brooklyn Half Marathon will take place. A portion of race will go down Ocean Parkway to Surf Avenue. Ocean Parkway will be closed from early morning to 1 p.m. At several locations on Ocean Parkway, there will be a place for people to cross Ocean Parkway. Very soon they will be removing the pilings that were installed in Coney Island Creek for the ferry. Eddie attended the Alliance meeting which dealt with the summer in the amusement area. It addressed illegal vendors, DCWP and DOS.

Michael Silverman asked why this time there wouldn't be shuttle bus service from Church Avenue to Coney Island. Eddie remarked that if this is correct, people will be stranded at Church Ave. Lucy recommended that we schedule a Transportation Committee as soon as possible or take a vote now on sending a letter to MTA. Michael thought it would be better to verify the information and then have a Transportation Committee meeting. Lucy said the Transportation Committee meeting will be scheduled.

Joann Weiss stated that as far as the illegal vendors are concerned, DOS knows nothing. Sanitation Enforcement is in charge of the vending issues. Yelena Makhnin said she was at a meeting with Steve Cohen and she is waiting for a summary of what was discussed. When she receives them, she will forward to the Board. There will be a Multiagency Task Force formed. Yelena suggested to send a list of locations of illegal vendors again, even though this was done before. The Task Force promised to come to Brighton Beach/Coney Island. She recommended to have meeting on Enforcement and that Sanitation should definitely be there and make a presentation.

Eddie mentioned that DCAS has approved new office space. Still in negotiations. Hopefully we will move before the end of 2023 if all goes well.

Ray Carrera from CAU is heading up a new program on illegal vending. Illegal vendors is a citywide problem. He suggested that all 311 complaints on illegal vending should be forwarded to Sanitation. He suggested Community Board set up a Sanitation meeting for DOS to explain exactly what they will be doing.

TREASURER'S REPORT: In the absence of Treasurer, Dionne Brown, Eddie gave a brief report. If further explanation is needed, feel free to contact the office.

CORRESPONDENCE

Shimon Rinkovsky

April 29, 2023 11 a.m. – 4 p.m. Healthy Kids Day Coney Island YWCA
10 a.m. – 12 noon Gardening at Asser Levy Park

Eddie stated that the new deadline for information to be put in our Newsletter is 2 p.m. on Friday. The Newsletter is sent out by 5 p.m.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Executive Committee

Lucy Mujica Diaz

The meeting was called to discuss the Board's Resolution on the Casino issue. It is a five page document.

Michael Silverman stated that he must recuse himself because his niece is employed by one of the companies involved. Michael Russo also has to recuse himself.

Yelena Makhnin asked to give point of information. CBA – Community Benefit Agreement is not legally binding in New York State and cannot be enforced. The CBA for the Barclay Center was entered into ten years ago and has not yet been fulfilled.

Allen Newman made a motion to postpone the submission of this Resolution until our Executive Committee has had an opportunity to promptly meet with the casino's executive committee to substantially discuss our community's concerns and needs; including but not limited to (1) existing business inclusion (2) a casino & food service job academy (3) public parking solutions and (4) additional access routes.

Michael Russo must recuse himself for the vote but can speak on the issue. He said that he agrees that there were two forums. On 4/19 there was a presentation. The developers did discuss what they are planning. If I knew that because it was held at my restaurant, I wouldn't be able to vote, I would have told them to go somewhere else. I thought that a motion had to be in the positive, this is not in the positive. Everyone in Coney Island is the recipient of someone else's investment. If we don't go with someone else's investment, we will have nothing. This Resolution was written without discussion. We, the community, needs to go forward. We can't live in the past. We must live for the future.

Pat O'Brien asked for clarification. He thought that the members can speak on the motion without the motion being seconded. Lucy said that was not correct. Members hands were up and if anyone else wanted to second the motion then we would take a vote.

Michael Silverman said it was a duly made motion and must have a second. A motion to reconsider takes precedent. Needs a vote to reconsider.

Pat O'Brien seconded Allen's motion. Allen made motion to reconsider the Executive Committee's motion to postpone the submission of the Resolution. There was a motion to reconsider made by Allen Newman, seconded by Pat O'Brien. If members want to reconsider the motion, they should vote "YES". If member want to approve the Executive Committee's Resolution, vote "NO".

Lolita asked if this is a motion to postpone and to meet with the casino people, do they have a date. Marion Cleaver said all the members are voting on is whether we should have Executive Committee recommendation or just go forward with the Resolution. Michael Silverman said there is no discussion on this either.

Lucy reviewed the situation. Allen and Pat O'Brien made motion/second to bring back to the table and get the developers to further explain. If that's what they agree with, say "YES". If the members agree with the existing Resolution, say "NO".

VOTE: In Favor: 14 Opposed: 18 Abstention: 0 Recusal: 1
Motion denied (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office. We will not revert to the original Resolution, which when voted on in committee was In Favor: 9 Opposed: 3 Recused: 1

Lucy said that she respects each person's input. She believes that even though the Board is only 50 members and there are 50,000 members of the community our voice is heard. The developers said that they couldn't disclose certain things because they're in a bidding process and didn't want the other developers to know. The open promises with no endings is why I won't vote for this proposal.

Yelena said she heard people say we should hear what the other side has to say. I don't care about square footage or number of parking spaces. The Resolution is not about specifics, it's about the entire proposal. The Community Benefit Agreement is not binding. Jeff said that the developers have had millions of pieces of literature printed, passed around houses, discussing public safety. All basically not true. The developers are trying to sell us a bill of goods, that this is what the community wants. Pat Singer said all this talk is speculation until you see it in black and white. The Resolution is undemocratic, it's wrong and not the way to go.

Lucy reminded the meeting that every year the board begs for more lifeguards and we are told not enough sign up or there is a problem with funds. What will the developers do about this? Pat Singer said that's why we should sit down and see what they can do. People who need jobs will benefit.

Marion Cleaver reminded everyone that when the Board was voting on MCU Stadium, how many were against the concept. Worried about how to get emergency vehicles down Surf Avenue. These were concerns. Traffic problems affect the community.

Lucy reminded everyone that without the knowledge of the Board, the developers placed a flyer on the back of the board's flyer about the meeting telling people to bring their resumes for jobs that were being offered. This was wrong! Amariyls Herrera said she attended both meetings and the Executive Committee meeting. She voted NO and just voted again. We shouldn't be doing this.

Pat O'Brien reminded everyone that 3 licenses are available and 8 rich entities are vying for this "1" location. If there is no way to win this for Coney Island then for sure it is going to Times Square. Perhaps we should get urban planners involved.

Julia Daniely said she went to the first meeting, and she is in favor of the casino. She will not go on personal feelings but will take consensus in her community.

Michael Russo said that it was mentioned at the second meeting that there were petitions with 3300 signatures. He also said that a CBA can be binding if it's written properly.

Motion was to return to Resolution voted for in Committee to oppose the Casino was called to a Vote: In Favor: 23 Opposed: 8 Abstentions: 2 Recuse: 2
Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office

License Committee

Yelena Makhnin, Chair

The applications will be voted on together. If not voting to approve all seven applications, please specify which you

Pancakes of Coney Island, LLC dba IHOP located at 1019 Surf Avenue. This is a revote for the new wine, beer and cider license that was voted on at the March, 2023 board meeting.

There was a technical issue and the stipulations were not received so we must revisit.

VOTE: In Favor: 31 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 3 Recusals: 0

Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office.

Day Party LLC located at 3030-3050 Stillwell Avenue. This is a revote for this new full liquor, wine, beer and cider license that was voted on at the March, 2023 board meeting. There was technical issue and stipulations were not received so we must revisit.

VOTE: In Favor: 29 Opposed: 2 Abstentions: 3 Recusals: 0

Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office.

Central Amusement International dba CAI Foods at Luna Park located at 1105 Boardwalk West.

Committee approved: Vote: In Favor: 8 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 0 Recusals: 0

Board Vote: In Favor: 31 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 3

Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office

Bagel Boutique LLC dba Clavel located at 1001 Brighton Beach Avenue

Committee approved: Vote: In Favor: 5 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 0 Recusals: 0

Board Vote: In Favor: 31 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 3 Recusals: 0

Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office

Juice & Moore located at 1915 Mermaid Avenue. To approve amended stipulations with new business hours and new operating hours.

Committee approved: Vote: In Favor: 5 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 0 Recusal: 0

Board Vote: In Favor: 31 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 3 Recusals: 0

Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office

EEE Albanese, Inc. dba TEURA Restaurant located at 1215 Surf Avenue. New wine, beer and cider application.

Committee approved: Vote: In Favor: 5 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 0 Recusal: 0

Board Vote: In Favor: 31 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 3 Recusals: 0

Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. Office

Taqueria Emilio 3 Corp. located at 3029 Stillwell Avenue. New wine, beer and cider application.

Committee approved without DJ: Vote: 5 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 0 Recusal: 0

Board Vote: In Favor: 31 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 3 Recusals: 0

Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office.

OLD BUSINESS: None

NEW BUSINESS:

Joann Weiss – At the last meeting of the 60th Pct Community Council, I introduced the new Executive Director of the Alliance Daniel Murphy. In his remarks he said, if anyone has issues that need to be resolved they should contact the Alliance. I made it clear that the Community Board speaks for the community, the Alliance does not, and if there are any issues, they should be brought to the Community Board.

Land Use Committee

Marion Cleaver/Shimon Rinkovsky, Co-Chair

Discussion on Guidelines for Street Co-Naming. These Guidelines are in line with the Ceremonial Street Co-Naming Guidelines from the Department of Transportation. The Committee decided that a person must be deceased for a minimum of three years before a Street Co-Naming can be discussed. CM Kagan has made it known that he feels this length of time is too long. Petitions containing 150 signatures of people in the community must be submitted along with the application. The applicant filing for the street co-naming must sign and date the application and have the application notarized, as well as each page of the petition.

Committee Vote: In Favor: 8 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 0 Recusals: 0

Board Vote: In Favor: 34 Opposed: 0 Abstentions: 0 Recusals: 0

No Vote: 5

Motion carried (quorum present) Roll call on file at C.B. office

There being no further business, motion to adjourn.

Barbara Santonas, Community Coordinator